

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Summary**

**Work Element**

	<b>Options Appraisal</b>	<b>Phase 1</b>	<b>Business Case Phase 2</b>	<b>Total</b>
Enabling Works	£ 59,448 *	£ 82,500	£ -	£ 82,500
Restoration of Mill	£ 71,663 *	£ 50,000	£ 84,984	£ 134,984
Restoration of Lade, Pond, Burn and Bridge Walls	£ 155,111 *	£ 35,900	£ 72,600	£ 108,500
Refurbishment of Miller's House, Byre, New Kitchen (Café Complex)	£ 407,113 *	£ -	£ 605,000	£ 605,000
	*			
Refurbishment of Grain Store	£ 65,010	£ 30,000	£ -	£ 30,000
Access Improvements	£ 249,248 *	£ -	£ 181,500	£ 181,500
New Activity Hub	£ 318,181 *	£ -	£ -	£ -
Woodland	£ 51,920 *	£ 15,000	£ -	£ 15,000
<b>Sub Totals</b>	<b>£ 1,377,695 *</b>	<b>£ 213,400</b>	<b>£ 944,084</b>	<b>£ 1,157,484</b>
Website and materials		£ 3,000		£ 3,000
<b>Sub Totals</b>	<b>£ 1,377,695 *</b>	<b>£ 216,400</b>	<b>£ 944,084</b>	<b>£ 1,160,484</b>
<b>Contingency</b>	<b>£ 137,769 *</b>	£ -	£ -	£ -
<b>Sub Totals</b>	<b>£ 1,515,464 *</b>	<b>£ 216,400</b>	<b>£ 944,084</b>	<b>£ 1,160,484</b>
<b>Inflationary increase on Capital (10%)</b>	N/A	NIL	NIL	£ -
<b><u>TOTALS</u></b>	<b>£ 1,515,464 *</b>	<b>£ 216,400</b>	<b>£ 944,084</b>	<b>£ 1,160,484</b>

\* Values include 10% Prelims and 18% Professional Fees and Expenses but exclude VAT

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**General Initial Site, Enabling and Safety Works**

		<b>Options Appraisal</b>	<b>Business Case</b>		
			<b>Phase 1</b>	<b>Phase 2</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>2.1.10</b>	<b>Ground Floor Interiors (65.6m2)</b>				
2.1.10	Investigate source of water ingress and halt it	£ 15,000			
		£ 15,000	£ 15,000		
	Remove hanging trees from woodland and othe management work				
3.3.6	Remove hanging trees	£ 3,000			
	Remove poor quality planters, signs, huts, etc.	£ 1,000			
	Remove disused huts and bike storage materials	£ 500			
<b>3.3</b>	<b>Paving, paths and bridges</b>				
3.3.1	Refurbish timber benches	£ 2,000			
3.3.2	Refurbish timber bridge, remove chicken wire	£ 3,000			
3.3.3	Refresh footpath surface and repair edging	£ 2,500			
3.3.4	Refresh signage	£ 2,000			
<b>2.5</b>	<b>Huts</b>				
2.5	Relocate huts to more appropriate locations on site (4 No)	£ 1,000			
2.5	Refurbish and repair huts (4 No)	£ 800			
	<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>£ 45,800</b>	<b>£ 75,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 75,000</b>
	Contingency (10%)	N/A	£ 7,500	£ -	
	Prelims (10%)	£ 4,580	N/A	N/A	
	<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>£ 50,380</b>	<b>£ 82,500</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 82,500</b>
		£ 9,068			
	Professional Fees & Expenses (18%)		N/A	N/A	
	<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 59,448</b>	<b>£ 82,500</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 82,500</b>
	<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>	N/A	Nil	Nil	
	<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 59,448</b>	<b>£ 82,500</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 82,500</b>
	Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)	£ 2,972.42	£ 4,125		
		£ 62,421	£ 86,625		

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Restoration of Mill**

	Options Appraisal	Business Case		
		Phase 1	Phase 2	Total
<b>2.1 THE MILL</b>				
<b>2.1.5 Masonry</b>				
2.1.5.a	Repoint in lime mortar, nom 8m2	£ 800	£ 800	£ 800
2.1.5.a	Remove redundant telephone cabling	£ 200	£ 200	£ 200
2.1.5.b	Replace rotten timber lintel 75x125x1400mm	£ 450	£ 450	£ 450
2.1.5.b	Repoint failing mortar with lime, nom 5m2	£ 400	£ 400	£ 400
2.1.5.b	Remove ferrous fixings	£ 100	£ 100	£ 100
2.1.5.c	Consolidate quoins at high level	£ 600	£ 600	£ 600
2.1.5.c	Rake out failing mortar and re-point with lime 8m2	£ 700	£ 700	£ 700
2.1.5.c	Consolidate stone lintel bedding	£ 300	£ 300	£ 300
2.1.5.d	Rake out failed mortar and all cement. Repoint with lime mortar, allow some deep consolidation nom. 25m2	£ 5,000	£ 5,000	£ 5,000
2.1.5.d	Consolidate lintel lime mortar	£ 300	£ 300	£ 300
2.1.5.d	Repair stone cill-remove iron fixings and repair with resin.	£ 350	£ 350	£ 350
2.1.5.d	Drill test timber lintel above 12 pane light. Allow for new replacement, nom 150x120x1400mm	£ 450	£ 450	£ 450
2.1.5.e	Rake out failed mortar and all cement pointing. Re-point with lime mortar 20m2	£ 1,800	£ 1,800	£ 1,800
2.1.5.e	Consolidate rubble at corner	£ 1,500	£ 1,500	£ 1,500
2.1.5.f	Rake out failed mortar and all cement pointing. Re-point with lime mortar 20m2	£ 1,800	£ 1,800	£ 1,800
2.1.5.f	Refurbish and consolidate area around door, cut out metal ferrous fixing and replace with stainless steel.	£ 650	£ 650	£ 650
2.1.5.f	Repair concrete cracks with resin	£ 300	£ 300	£ 300
2.1.5.f	Remove 10 no. ferrous fixings	£ 150	£ 150	£ 150
<b>2.1.6 Roof</b>				£ -
2.1.6	Trim back bitumen membrane	£ 100	£ 100	£ 100
2.1.6	Rake out and replace cement bedding for hips and redges nom. 35m2	£ 4,000	£ 4,000	£ 4,000
2.1.6	Strip modern roof finishes and reinstate stone slabs with stone ridges and oak pegs nom 95m2 and corrugated iron over the kiln, with gabled end, nom 45m2.		£ -	£ -
2.1.6	Alternative allowance for minor slate repairs.	£ 3,000	£ 3,000	£ 3,000
2.1.6	Replace ventilator to match previous one.		£ -	£ -
2.1.6	Reinstate 2 cast iron rooflights, complete with lead flashings.		£ -	£ -
<b>2.1.7 Rainwater Goods</b>				£ -
2.1.7	Clear out vegetation from gutters	£ 200	£ 200	£ 200
2.1.7	Refurbish cast iron rhones, rub down and repaint, nom, 38m	£ 450	£ 450	£ 450
2.1.7	Replace 2 plastic downpipe legs with cast iron.	£ 1,500	£ 1,500	£ 1,500
2.1.7	Redirect water discharging straight into ground away from building, 2 no.	£ 2,000	£ 2,000	£ 2,000
<b>2.1.8 Windows, Louvres and Rooflights</b>				£ -

2.1.8	8 Small and medium sized timber windows to have minor repairs, be refurbished, repainted and traditional mastic sand renewed	£ 2,400		£ 2,400	£ 2,400
2.1.8	1 Louvre to be repaired, rubbed down and repainted, mastic sand renewed.	£ 400		£ 400	£ 400
2.1.8	Fit 3 new small cast iron rooflights, with associated lead flashings	£ 3,300		£ 3,300	£ 3,300
<b>2.1.9</b>	<b>Doors</b>			£ -	
2.1.9	4 Doors to have minor timber repairs, loose paint removed, rubbed down repainted, with new mastic sand.	£ 1,200		£ 1,200	£ 1,200
<b>2.1.10</b>	<b>Ground Floor Interiors (65.6m2)</b>			£ -	
2.1.10	Investigate source of water ingress and halt it.			£ -	
2.1.10	Rake out cement pointing and replace in lime, nom. 20m2	£ 1,800		£ 1,800	£ 1,800
2.1.10	Remove modern white paint and refinish wall interior with lime wash nom. 30m2	£ 1,650		£ 1,650	£ 1,650
2.1.10	Trim back dpc to FF joists	£ 200		£ 200	£ 200
2.1.10	Replace missing machinery belts.	£ -		£ -	£ -
<b>2.1.11</b>	<b>First Floor Interiors (83.4m2)</b>			£ -	
2.1.11	Rake out cement pointing and replace in lime, nom. 20m2	£ 1,800		£ 1,800	£ 1,800
2.1.11	Remove dead swallow and nest from drying room	£ 30		£ 30	£ 30
2.1.11	Test integrity of internal lintel	£ 30		£ 30	£ 30
2.1.11	Replace defective cill with new stone cill,	£ 400		£ 400	£ 400
2.1.11	Remove modern white paint and refinish wall interior with lime wash nom. 60m2	£ 3,300		£ 3,300	£ 3,300
<b>2.1.12</b>	<b>Mill Mechanisms, Fixtures and Fittings</b>			£ -	
2.1.12	Specialist inspection of mill mechanisms	£ 500		£ 500	£ 500
2.1.12	Allowance for minor repairs	£ 500		£ 500	£ 500
2.1.12	Replace missing belts	£ 300		£ 300	£ 300
<b>2.1.13</b>	<b>Electrical Repairs</b>			£ -	
2.1.13	Test all electrics	£ 300		£ 300	£ 300
2.1.13	Replace lighting system	£ 10,000		£ 10,000	£ 10,000
	Subtotal	£ 55,210	£ -	£ 55,210	£ 55,210
	<b>Allow for additional costs in restoration of Mill to cover further deterioration</b>			£ 15,025	£ 15,025
	<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 55,210</b>	<b>£ 50,000</b>	<b>£ 70,235</b>	<b>£ 120,235</b>
	Contingency (10%)	N/A	N/A	£ 7,024	£ 7,024
	Prelims 10%	£ 5,521	N/A	N/A	£ -
	<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 60,731</b>	<b>£ 50,000</b>	<b>£ 77,259</b>	<b>£ 127,259</b>
	Professional Fees and Expenses @18%	£ 10,932	N/A	N/A	£ -
	<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 71,663</b>	<b>£ 50,000</b>	<b>£ 77,259</b>	<b>£ 127,259</b>
	<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>	N/A	Nil	£ 7,726	£ 7,726
	<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 71,663</b>	<b>£ 50,000</b>	<b>£ 84,984</b>	<b>£ 134,984</b>
	Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)	£ 3,583.13			£ 6,749.22
		£ 75,246			£ 141,734

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Restoration of Lade Pond and Burn Walls**

		<b>Options</b>	<b>Business Case</b>		
		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Phase 1</b>	<b>Phase 2</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>3.1 Mill Lade &amp; Pond</b>					
3.1	Replace rotten and defective timbersections of lade. Allow for full dismantling and renewal of lade, with excavations and linings to reinstate original as far as can be determined.	£ 85,000			
3.1	Remove silt build-up from pond, check integrity of lining, assume minor repairs and replace overflow pipes with new fireclay pipes discretely located.	£ 20,000			
3.1	<i>Commence works on lade and clearing out pond</i>		£ 25,000		
<b>3.2 Walls</b>					
3.2.1	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 20m2				
3.2.1	Cut back trees locally	£ 500	£ 500		
3.2.2	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 36m2				
3.2.2	Clear drain pipe	£ 300	£ 300		
3.2.3	Rake out failed cement mortar and repoint with lime mortar, nom. 40m2	£ 3,600			
3.2.3	Fit sign for former kiln				
3.2.4	Consolidate rubble with hydraulic lime mortar, nom. 30m2	£ 9,000	£ 9,000		
3.2.4	Remove rust and repaint railing, replace chicken mesh.	£ 1,100	£ 1,100		
	<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 119,500</b>	<b>£ 35,900</b>	<b>£ 60,000</b>	<b>£ 95,900</b>
	Contingency (10%)	N/A	N/A	£ 6,000	£ 6,000
	Prelims 10%	£ 11,950	N/A	N/A	£ -
	<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 131,450</b>	<b>£ 35,900</b>	<b>£ 66,000</b>	<b>£ 101,900</b>
	Professional Fees and Expenses @18%	£ 23,661	N/A	N/A	£ -
	<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 155,111</b>	<b>£ 35,900</b>	<b>£ 66,000</b>	<b>£ 101,900</b>
	<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>	N/A	Nil	£ 6,600	£ 6,600
	<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 155,111</b>	<b>£ 35,900</b>	<b>£ 72,600</b>	<b>£ 108,500</b>
	<b>Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)</b>	<b>£ 7,755.55</b>			<b>£ 5,425</b>
		<b>£ 162,866.55</b>			<b>£ 113,925</b>

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Refurbishment of Miller's House**

		Options Appraisal	Business Case		
			Phase 1	Phase 2	Total
<b>2.2</b>	<b>THE MILLER'S HOUSE</b>				
<b>2.2.5</b>	<b>Masonry</b>				
2.2.5a	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom, 16m2	£ 1,500			
2.2.5a	Remove window boxes	£ 20			
2.2.5b	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 15m2	£ 1,400			
2.2.5b	Remove redundant wiring	£ 100			
2.2.5c	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar nom. 10m2	£ 900			
2.2.5d	Rake out defective [pointing and replace with lime mortar nom. 15m2	£ 1,400			
2.2.5d	Sleeve overflow pipe with lead	£ 100			
2.2.5d	Remove cement haunching where previous building abutted.	£ 200			
<b>2.2.6</b>	<b>Lean-to Extension</b>				
2.2.6	Demolish extension nom.6x6m				
<b>2.2.7</b>	<b>Roof</b>				
2.2.7	Replace missing slates nom. 12,refix slipped ones	£ 200			
2.2.7	Renew lead flashings to chimneys nom. 4m in code 6	£ 550			
2.2.7	Rebed fireclay ridge with lime mortar	£ 600			
	<b>Rot/timber repairs</b>	£ 500			
<b>2.2.8</b>	<b>Rainwater Goods</b>				
2.2.8	Clear all vegetation from gutters	£ 100			
2.2.8	Replace plastic rainwater goods with cast iron.	£ 300			
2.2.8	Form gully and 2m drain pipe to burn for 1 down pipe.	£ 500			
2.2.8	Refurbish and repaint existing cast iron rainwater rhones, 16m and pipes 5m.	£ 1,000			
<b>2.2.9</b>	<b>Windows, Louvres and Rooflights</b>				
2.2.9	7 Small and medium sized timber windows to have minor repairs, to be refurbished, repainted and traditional mastic sand renewed.	£ 2,100			
2.2.9	Refurbish 3 new small cast iron rooflights, with associated lead flashings.	£ 1,500			
2.2.9	Remove extract fan and re-glaze.	£ 80			

<b>2.2.10</b>	<b>Doors</b>		
2.2.10	3 Doors to have minor timber repairs loose paint removed down, repainted and new mastic sand.	£	900

<b>2.2.11</b>	<b>Ground Floor Interiors</b>		
2.2.11	Repaint floor nom. 50m2		
2.2.11	Remove synthetic paint from walls and limewash nom. 75m2.	£	3,000

<b>2.2.12</b>	<b>Electrical Services</b>		
2.2.12	Test electrics	£	300
2.2.12	Renew lighting		
2.2.12	Replace extract fan with new one using former chimney	£	900

	<b>Miller's House Alterations</b>		
	Lift concrete floor install new 200mm insulation, dpm and stone floor c.w. underfloor heating, nom. 36m2	£	14,400
	New insulated wall lining, timber frame, 200mm sheepswool, boards and clay plaster finish.	£	11,700
	Strip ceiling lining, fit new 300mm insulation and dwang out to new 18mm redwood lining boards	£	5,400
	New quality lighting and power, nom. 45m2	£	9,000
	Furnishings & fittings - café seating, etc.	£	3,500
	<b>Sub total</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>62,150</b>

**2.3 BYRE**

<b>2.3.5</b>	<b>Masonry</b>		
2.3.5a	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 15m2	£	1,400
2.3.5a	Sleeve overflow pipe with lead	£	100
2.3.5b	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 14m2	£	1,200
2.3.5b	Consolidate voids at low level	£	300
2.3.5b	Remove redundant iron fixings	£	100
2.3.5b	Replace quoin, nom.200x350x600mm.	£	300
2.3.5c	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 4m2	£	400
2.3.5d	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 2m2	£	200

**2.3.6 Roof**

2.3.6 It would be desirable to  
reinststate the original  
arrangement of rooflight  
ventilator and have more  
appropriate ridges, nom. 100m2

£ 4,500

**2.3.7 Rainwater Goods**

2.3.7 Refurbish and repaint 26m cast  
iron rhones

£ 1,500

2.3.7 Replace 5m pvc rhones with  
cast iron painted.

£ 400

2.3.7 Refurbish and repaint 5m cast  
ironpipes.

£ 200

2.3.7 Realign drain so water does not  
discharge directly onto ground.

£ 1,000

**2.3.8 Windows and Rooflights**

2.3.8 Refurbish 2 small cast iron  
rooflights with associated lead  
flashings.

£ 1,000

**2.3.9 Doors**

2.3.9 3 Doors to have minor timber  
repairs, loose paint removed  
down repainted and new mastic  
sand to one.

£ 1,500

**2.3.10 Ground Floor Interiors 44m2**

2.3.10a Remove synthetic paint and  
limewash walls, nom. 35m2

£ 2,500

2.3.10a Repaint floor, nom. 17m2

£ 300

2.3.10b Investigate source of damp and  
rectify.

£ 10,000

2.3.10b Remove synthetic paint and  
limewash walls, nom.8m2

£ 450

2.3.10b Repaint floor, nom. 8m2

£ 80

2.3.10c Remove synthetic paint and  
limewash walls, nom. 6m2

£ 350

2.3.10c Repaint floor, nom. 4m2

£ 40

2.3.10d Remove synthetic paint and  
limewash walls, nom. 25m2

£ 2,200

2.3.10d Repaint floor, nom. 8m2

£ 80

2.3.10e Remove synthetic paint and  
limewash walls, nom. 6m2

£ 400

2.3.10e Repaint floor, nom. 6m2

£ 60

**2.3.11 Electrical Services**

2.3.11 Test electrics

£ 300

2.3.11 Renew lighting

2.3.11 Replace extract fans

**Byre Alterations**

Lift concrete floor, install new  
200mm insulation, dpm and  
stone floor

£ 15,200

New insulated wall lining,  
timber frame, 200mm  
sheepswool, boards and clay  
plaster finish.

£ 12,636

Strip ceiling lining, fit new  
300mm insulation and dwang  
out to new 18mm redwood  
lining boards

£ 4,800

Fit out new unisex toilets, 3 w.c. and 1 accessible baby changing including plumbing, heating, etc.	£	20,000
New quality lighting and power	£	5,000
Furnishings and fittings	£	3,000
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>91,496</b>

#### NEW KITCHEN

##### 2.2.6 *Lean-to Extension*

2.2.6 Demolish extension nom.6x6m	£	2,200
-----------------------------------	---	-------

##### *New Corner Block* £ 157,800

Excavate for foundations  
 Consolidate retaining wall and tank  
 New concrete slab, 200mm insulation, u.f. heating, stone finish  
 New timber frame external walls, 300mm insulation, timber boarded lining internally and externally.  
 New internal walls, 300mm insulation, timber boarded lining internally and externally.

New timber frame roof, 300  
 Kitchen fit-out, quality domestic standard  
 Servery and shop fit-out (actually in café this option).

Heating system  
 Power and lighting

<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>160,000</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>-</b>
-----------------	----------	----------------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------	----------

<b>Total Miller's House, Byre and New Kitchen</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>313,646</b>			<b>£</b>	<b>500,000</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>500,000</b>
---------------------------------------------------	----------	----------------	--	--	----------	----------------	----------	----------------

Contingency (10%)		N/A	N/A	£	50,000	£	50,000
-------------------	--	-----	-----	---	--------	---	--------

Prelims 10%	£	31,365	N/A	N/A	£	-
-------------	---	--------	-----	-----	---	---

<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>345,011</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>550,000</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>550,000</b>
------------------	----------	----------------	----------	----------	----------	----------------	----------	----------------

Professional Fees and Expenses @18%	£	62,102	N/A	N/A	£	-
-------------------------------------	---	--------	-----	-----	---	---

<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>407,113</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>550,000</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>550,000</b>
------------------------	----------	----------------	----------	----------	----------	----------------	----------	----------------

<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>		N/A	Nil	£	55,000	£	55,000
-------------------------------------------------------	--	-----	-----	---	--------	---	--------

<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>407,113</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>605,000</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>605,000</b>
-------------------	----------	----------------	----------	----------	----------	----------------	----------	----------------

Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)	£	20,355.63				£	30,250
----------------------------	---	-----------	--	--	--	---	--------

	£	427,468.13				£	635,250
--	---	------------	--	--	--	---	---------

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Refurbishment of Byre**

		Options Appraisal	Business Case		
			Phase 1	Phase 2	Total
<b>2.3</b>	<b>BYRE</b>				
<b>2.3.5</b>	<b>Masonry</b>				
2.3.5a	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 15m <sup>2</sup>	£	1,400		
2.3.5a	Sleeve overflow pipe with lead	£	100		
2.3.5b	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 14m <sup>2</sup>	£	1,200		
2.3.5b	Consolidate voids at low level	£	300		
2.3.5b	Remove redundant iron fixings	£	100		
2.3.5b	Replace quoin, nom.200x350x600mm.	£	300		
2.3.5c	Rake out defective pointing and	£	400		
2.3.5d	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 2m <sup>2</sup>	£	200		
<b>2.3.6</b>	<b>Roof</b>				
2.3.6	It would be desirable to reinstate the original arrangement of rooflight ventilator and have more appropriate ridges, nom. 100m <sup>2</sup>	£	4,500		
<b>2.3.7</b>	<b>Rainwater Goods</b>				
2.3.7	Refurbish and repaint 26m cast iron rhones	£	1,500		
2.3.7	Replace 5m pvc rhones with cast iron painted.	£	400		
2.3.7	Refurbish and repaint 5m cast ironpipes.	£	200		
2.3.7	Realign drain so water does not discharge directly onto ground.	£	1,000		
<b>2.3.8</b>	<b>Windows and Rooflights</b>				
2.3.8	Refurbish 2 small cast iron rooflights with associated lead flashings.	£	1,000		
<b>2.3.9</b>	<b>Doors</b>				
2.3.9	3 Doors to have minor timber repairs, loose paint removed down repainted and new mastic sand to one.	£	1,500		
<b>2.3.10</b>	<b>Ground Floor Interiors 44m<sup>2</sup></b>				
2.3.10a	Remove synthetic paint and limewash walls, nom. 35m <sup>2</sup>	£	2,500		
2.3.10a	Repaint floor, nom. 17m <sup>2</sup>	£	300		
2.3.10b	Investigate source of damp and rectify.	£	12,000		

2.3.10b	Remove synthetic paint and limewash walls, nom.8m2	£	450
2.3.10b	Repaint floor, nom. 8m2	£	80
2.3.10c	Remove synthetic paint and limewash walls, nom. 6m2	£	350
2.3.10c	Repaint floor, nom. 4m2	£	40
2.3.10d	Remove synthetic paint and limewash walls, nom. 25m2	£	2,200
2.3.10d	Repaint floor, nom. 8m2	£	80
2.3.10e	Remove synthetic paint and limewash walls, nom. 6m2	£	400
2.3.10e	Repaint floor, nom. 6m2	£	60
<b>2.3.11 Electrical Services</b>			
2.3.11	Test electrics	£	300
2.3.11	Renew lighting		
2.3.11	Replace extract fans		

#### Byre Alterations

Lift concrete floor, install new 200mm insulation, dpm and stone floor	£	15,200
New insulated wall lining, timber frame, 200mm sheepswool, boards and clay plaster finish.	£	12,636
Strip ceiling lining, fit new 300mm insulation and dwang out to new 18mm redwood lining boards	£	4,800
Fit out new unisex toilets, 3 w.c. and 1 accessible baby changing including plumbing, heating, etc.	£	20,000
New quality lighting and power	£	5,000
Furnishings and fittings	£	3,000

**Subtotals** £ 93,496 \*      £ -      £ -      £ -

Contingency (10%)      N/A      N/A      N/A      £ -

Prelims 10%      £ 9,350      N/A      N/A      £ -

**Subtotals** £ 102,846      £ -      £ -      £ -

Professional Fees and Expenses @18%      £ 18,512      N/A      N/A      £ -

**Nett Total Cost** £ 121,358      £ -      £ -      £ -

**Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation**      N/A      N/A      N/A      £ -

**Total Cost** £ 121,358      £ -      £ -      £ -

<p>Note *: Options Appraisal double counted £91,496 twice. This led to an overestimate at "Total Cost" of £118,762</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

## Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016

### Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request

#### Refurbishment of Grain Store

		Options	Business Case		
		Appraisal	Phase 1	Phase 2	Total
<b>2.4</b>	<b>GRAIN STORE</b>				
<b>2.4.5</b>	<b>Masonry</b>				
2.4.5a	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 15m2	£ 135			
2.4.5b	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 10m2	£ 900			
2.4.5c	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 15m2	£ 1,400			
2.4.5d	Replace cement with new stone, nom. 300x300x200mm.	£ 300			
2.4.5d	Rake out defective pointing and replace with lime mortar, nom. 10m2	£ 900			
<b>2.4.6</b>	<b>Roof</b>				
2.4.6	Check ventilation to roof space	£ 200			
2.4.6	It would be desirable to reinstate a corrugated iron roof to the original line, nom. 45m2	£ 8,000			
<b>2.4.7</b>	<b>Rainwater Goods</b>				
2.4.7	Refurbish and repaint 22m c.i. rhones	£ 1,400			
2.4.7	Refurbish and repaint 5m c.i.pipes	£ 350			
2.4.7	Fit gully and local drainage to foot of pipes.	£ 2,000			
<b>2.4.8</b>	<b>Windows and Rooflights</b>				
2.4.8	Refurbish and repaint 2 windows	£ 600			
<b>2.4.9</b>	<b>Doors</b>				
2.4.9	3 Doors to have minor timber repairs, loose paint removed, rubbed down, repainted and new mastic sand to one.	£ 900			
<b>2.4.11</b>	<b>Electrical Services</b>				
2.4.11	Test electrics	£ 300			
2.4.11	Renew lighting	£ 2,000			

#### Grain Drying

Lift concrete floor, install new 200mm insulation, dpm and stone floor	£	11,200			
New insulated wall lining, timber frame, 200mm sheepswool, timber board lining	£	9,900			
Strip ceiling lining, fit new 300mm insulation and dwang out to new 18mm redwood lining boards	£	3,600			
New quality lighting and power	£	4,000			
Furnishings and fittings - staff room and store.	£	2,000			
<b>Initial Redevelopment</b>					
Architectural and planning fees	£		4,230		
Removal of partitions, make good, units worktops	£		3,200		
Plumbing Work	£		470		
Electrical work	£		2,100		
Flooring and decoration	£		4,000		
Refurbish door and windows	£		1,000		
Furnishings and equipment	£		15,000		
<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>50,085</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>
Contingency (10%)		N/A	N/A	N/A	£ -
Prelims 10%	£	5,009	N/A	N/A	£ -
<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>55,094</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>
Professional Fees and Expenses @18%	£	9,917		N/A	£ -
<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>65,010</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>
<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>		N/A	£ -	£ -	£ -
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£</b>	<b>65,010</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 30,000</b>
Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)	£	3,251			£ 1,500
	£	68,261			£ 31,500

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**

**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

<b>New Kitchen</b>		<b>Options</b>	<b>Business Case</b>		
		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Phase 1</b>	<b>Phase 2</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>2.2.6</b>	<b><i>Lean-to Extension</i></b>				
2.2.6	Demolish extension nom.6x6m	£ 2,200			
	<b><i>New Corner Block</i></b>	£ 157,800			
	Excavate for foundations				
	Consolidate retaining wall and tank				
	New concrete slab, 200mm insulation, u.f. heating, stone finish				
	New timber frame external walls, 300mm insulation, timber boarded lining internally and externally.				
	New internal walls, 300mm insulation, timber boarded lining internally and externally.				
	New timber frame roof, 300				
	Kitchen fit-out, quality domestic standard				
	Servery and shop fit-out (actually in café this option).				
	Heating system				
	Power and lighting				
	<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 160,000</b>			<b>£ -</b>
	Contingency (10%)	N/A	N/A	N/A	£ -
	Prelims 10%	£ 16,000	N/A	N/A	£ -
	<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 176,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>
	Professional Fees and Expenses @18%	£ 31,680	N/A	N/A	£ -
	<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 207,680</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>
	<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>	N/A	£ -	£ -	£ -
	<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 207,680</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>
	<b>Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)</b>	<b>£ 10,384</b>			
		<b>£ 218,064</b>			

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Access Improvements**

	<b>Options Appraisal</b>	<b>Business Case</b>		
		Phase 1	Phase 2	Total
<b>ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS INDICATIVE COSTS</b>				
<b>Entrance</b>				
<b><i>Downtakings</i></b>				
Remove post & wire fencing around former garde nom. 70m	£ 350			
Remove post & wire fencing to S edge of west path, nom. 40m	£ 200			
Dig up existing entrance splay	£ 1,000			
Relocate mill stone (and remove lych gate)	£ 3,000			
Remove roadside trees.	£ 1,000			
Remove grassed banks as required for new parking areas.	£ 4,000			
Clean off old bridge surface	£ 800			
Relocate mill entrance gate on adjacent access road	£ 500			
<b><i>New Surfaces</i></b>				
Form 2 new tarmac bellmouth junctions, nom. 75m <sup>2</sup>				
Form new car parking area, with 2 junction splays and marked bays, bound gravel?, nom. 1250m <sup>2</sup>	£ 20,000			
Form new pedestrian paths and display areas, nom. 330m <sup>2</sup> bound gravel?	£ 10,000			
Lay new bound gravel surface to old bridge.				
<b><i>Interpretation</i></b>				
Decorative information wall, nom 80mx3m in corten sheet to rear frame with conc found to suit.	£ 30,000			
Entrance sign in corten steel, with solar lights.	£ 1,500			
Directional sign to paths	£ 1,200			
<b><i>External Furniture</i></b>				
12 s.s. cycle stands	£ 500			
Bespoke seating/picnic benches	£ 1,600			

**Services** £ 3,000

Discrete external lighting, solar powered?

**3.3 Paving, Paths & Bridges**

3.3.1 Replace concrete paving with sandstone paving, nom. 40m2 £ 8,000

3.3.3 Renew paving in stone, 40m2 £ 8,000

**Landscape**

New bound gravel topping to approach track, 640m2 £ 25,000

Renew path alongside of lade, with new edging and bound gravel surface. £ 12,375

Renew path via reed bed £ 5,000

New stone paved seating area in front of café, 70m2 £ 15,000

New paved area to west of mill £ 5,000

New bound gravel area in front of mill £ 5,000

Refurbish and repaint metal railing to burn, 60m x 1m. incl

New quality interpretive signage throughout the site. £ 5,000

New quality lighting around the site. £ 20,000

Allow for new planting around site. £ 5,000

**Subtotals** £ 192,025 £ 150,000 £ 150,000

Contingency (10%) N/A N/A £ 15,000 £ 15,000

Prelims 10% £ 19,203 N/A N/A £ -

**Subtotals** £ 211,228 £ - £ 165,000 £ 165,000

Professional Fees and Expenses @18% £ 38,021 N/A N/A £ -

**Nett Total Cost** £ 249,248 £ - £ 165,000 £ 165,000

**Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation** N/A £ - £ 16,500 £ 16,500

**Total Cost** £ 249,248 £ - £ 181,500 £ 181,500

**Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)** £ 12,462.42 £ 9,075

**£ 261,710.87 £ 190,575**

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**New Activity Space**

	<b>Options Appraisal</b>	<b>Business Case</b>		
		<b>Phase 1</b>	<b>Phase 2</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>NEW ACTIVITY SPACE</b>				
New Building	£ 200,000			
Extend existing site services	£ 25,000			
Associated landscape work	£ 20,132			
<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 245,132</b>			
Contingency (10%)	N/A	N/A	N/A	£ -
Prelims 10%	£ 24,513	N/A	N/A	£ -
<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 269,645</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>
Professional Fees and Expenses @18%	£ 48,536	N/A	N/A	£ -
<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 318,181</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>
<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>	N/A	£ -	£ -	£ -
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 318,181</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ -</b>
<b>Inflation 2016 - 2019 (10%)</b>	<b>£ 31,818.13</b>			
	<b>£ 349,999.47</b>			

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**  
**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Woodland Indicative Cost**

	<b>Options Appraisal</b>	<b>Business Case</b>		
		<b>Phase 1</b>	<b>Phase 2</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>LANDSCAPE</b>				
Woodland management works	£ 5,000			
Refurbish all woodland paths (800m)	£ 30,000	£ 15,000		
New quality interpretive signage	£ 5,000			
<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 40,000</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>
Contingency (10%)	N/A	N/A	N/A	£ -
Prelims 10%	£ 4,000	N/A	N/A	£ -
<b>Subtotals</b>	<b>£ 44,000</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>
Professional Fees and Expenses @18%	£ 7,920	N/A	N/A	£ -
<b>Nett Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 51,920</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>
<b>Business Plan Additional Contingency/Inflation</b>	N/A	£ -	£ -	£ -
<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>£ 51,920</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>	<b>£ -</b>	<b>£ 15,000</b>
Inflation 2016 - 2019 (5%)	£ 2,596			£ 750
	£ 54,516			£ 15,750

**Mill of Benholm Options Appraisal Report December 2016**

**Comparison with Values Contained on Business Case Prepared for Asset Transfer Request**

**Summary Options Appraisal Comparison**

**Work Element**

	A Options Appraisal Revised	B Options Appraisal Original	C Variance (A-B)	
Enabling Works	£ 59,448	£ 59,448	£ 0	
Restoration of Mill	£ 71,663	£ 70,235	£ 1,428	
Restoration of Lade, Pond, Burn and Bridge Walls	£ 155,111	£ 155,111	£ -	
Refurbishment of Miller's House, Byre, New Kitchen (Café Complex)	£ 407,113	£ 525,206 *	-£ 118,093	* Page 169 Sub-total £91,496 + 10% Prelims + 18% Fees = £118,472 counted twice
Refurbishment of Grain Store	£ 65,010	£ 65,010	£ 0	
Access Improvements	£ 249,248	£ 236,268	£ 12,980	
New Activity Hub	£ 318,181	£ 318,182	-£ 1	
Woodland	£ 51,920	£ 51,920	£ -	
<b>Sub Totals</b>	<b>£ 1,377,695</b>	<b>£ 1,481,380</b>	<b>-£ 103,685</b>	
Website and materials				
<b>Sub Totals</b>	<b>£ 1,377,695</b>	<b>£ 1,481,380</b>	<b>-£ 103,685</b>	
<b>Contingency</b>	<b>£ 137,769</b>	<b>£ 153,140 *</b>	<b>-£ 15,371</b>	* Contingency £5,002 greater than !0%
<b>Sub Totals</b>	<b>£ 1,515,464</b>	<b>£ 1,634,520</b>	<b>-£ 119,056</b>	
<b>Inflationary increase on Capital (10%)</b>	N/A	N/A		
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>£ 1,515,464</b>	<b>£ 1,634,520</b>	<b>-£ 119,056</b>	