

Aberdeenshire Council

Integrated Impact Assessment

Instrumental Music Service (Savings)

Assessment ID	IIA-000458
Lead Author	Justin Brook
Additional Authors	Avril Nicol
Service Reviewers	Avril Nicol, John Cornfield
Subject Matter Experts	Susan Forbes, Lynne Gravener, Christine McLennan
Approved By	Avril Nicol
Approved On	Friday February 04, 2022
Publication Date	Friday February 04, 2022

1. Overview

This document has been generated from information entered into the Integrated Impact Assessment system.

This assessment looks at the impact that a reduced resource in the event of significant savings being required will have on Aberdeenshire school children. The assessment also looks at the redesign of the service in order to provide relevant information on new models of delivery in order to continue to provide high quality instrumental music tuition to young people in Aberdeenshire schools.

During screening 5 of 10 questions indicated that detailed assessments were required, the screening questions and their answers are listed in the next section. This led to 3 out of 5 detailed impact assessments being completed. The assessments required are:

- Childrens' Rights and Wellbeing
- Equalities and Fairer Scotland Duty
- Health Inequalities

In total there are 12 positive impacts as part of this activity. There are 6 negative impacts, of these negative impacts, 9 have been mitigated and 0 cannot be mitigated satisfactorily.

A detailed action plan with 5 points has been provided.

This assessment has been approved by avril.nicol@aberdeenshire.gov.uk.

The remainder of this document sets out the details of all completed impact assessments.

2. Screening

Could your activity / proposal / policy cause an impact in one (or more) of the identified town centres?	No
Would this activity / proposal / policy have consequences for the health and wellbeing of the population in the affected communities?	Yes
Does the activity / proposal / policy have the potential to affect greenhouse gas emissions (CO2e) in the Council or community and / or the procurement, use or disposal of physical resources?	No
Does the activity / proposal / policy have the potential to affect the resilience to extreme weather events and/or a changing climate of Aberdeenshire Council or community?	No
Does the activity / proposal / policy have the potential to affect the environment, wildlife or biodiversity?	No
Does the activity / proposal / policy have an impact on people and / or groups with protected characteristics?	No
Is this activity / proposal / policy of strategic importance for the council?	Yes
Does this activity / proposal / policy reduce inequality of outcome?	Yes
Does this activity / proposal / policy have an impact on children / young people's rights?	Yes
Does this activity / proposal / policy have an impact on children / young people's wellbeing?	Yes

3. Impact Assessments

Children's Rights and Wellbeing	All Negative Impacts Can Be Mitigated
Climate Change and Sustainability	Not Required
Equalities and Fairer Scotland Duty	All Negative Impacts Can Be Mitigated
Health Inequalities	All Negative Impacts Can Be Mitigated
Town Centre's First	Not Required

4. Childrens' Rights and Wellbeing Impact Assessment

4.1. Wellbeing Indicators

Indicator	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Unknown
Safe		Yes		
Healthy			Yes	
Achieving			Yes	
Nurtured		Yes		
Active		Yes		
Respected		Yes		
Responsible	Yes			
Included	Yes			

4.2. Rights Indicators

UNCRC Indicators upheld by this activity / proposal / policy	<p>Article 1 - Definition of a child</p> <p>Article 2 - Non-discrimination</p> <p>Article 3 - Best interests of the child</p> <p>Article 4 - Protection of rights</p> <p>Article 12 - Respect for the views of the child</p> <p>Article 13 - Freedom of expression</p> <p>Article 15 - Freedom of association</p> <p>Article 18 - Parental responsibilities and state assistance</p> <p>Article 28 - Right to education</p> <p>Article 29 - Goals of education</p> <p>Article 31 - Leisure, play and culture</p>
--	--

4.3. Positive Impacts

Impact Area	Impact
Included	The redesign of the IMS will include more large group tuition and digital delivery. This could result in children who would otherwise not engage in music tuition becoming valued participants
Included	Digital delivery will have the potential to reach schools that have previously been difficult to provide tuition due to their geographically challenging location
Included	A greater number of large group tuition instances will provide the opportunity to encourage participation for children who would otherwise be unlikely to engage in instrumental tuition
Included	The redesign of the IMS will include more large group tuition and digital delivery. This could result in children who would otherwise not engage in music tuition becoming valued participants
Included	Digital delivery will have the potential to reach schools that have previously been difficult to provide tuition due to their geographically challenging location

Impact Area	Impact
Included	A greater number of large group tuition instances will provide the opportunity to encourage participation for children who would otherwise be unlikely to engage in instrumental tuition
Responsible	Large group tuition and digital delivery give opportunity for a greater level of autonomy and responsibility for young people
Responsible	Large group tuition and digital delivery give opportunity for a greater level of autonomy and responsibility for young people
Responsible	Large group tuition and digital delivery give opportunity for a greater level of autonomy and responsibility for young people

4.4. Negative Impacts and Mitigations

Impact Area	Details and Mitigation
Achieving	<p>The number of children achieving both as a personal sense of achievement as well as academic achievement could be reduced if the capacity of the IMS is reduced</p> <p>Can be mitigated Yes</p> <p>Mitigation Promoting achievement will continue. The redesign of service tuition such as large group tuition and digital delivery will aim to maintain current levels and through development of models expand pupil numbers and activities in the future</p> <p>Timescale Academic session 2021-2022 Redesign development 2022</p>
Healthy	<p>A reduced IMS may not be able to deliver to as many pupils as it has done in the past. For many children instrumental music is an important part of balancing negative and positive mental health. Instrumental music tuition and associated activities have a positive impact on children, so for those unable to access tuition there is a risk of a negative impact</p> <p>Can be mitigated Yes</p> <p>Mitigation Delivery and support for children will continue but with reduced capacity, so fewer children will benefit, however, service developments such as large group tuition will aim to address this</p> <p>Timescale Immediate</p>

4.5. Evidence

Type	Source	It says?	It Means?
------	--------	----------	-----------

Type	Source	It says?	It Means?
Internal Data	Paritor database; Improvement Service Report; IMS Databases: Improvement Plans; IMS Reports	Previous Equality Impact Assessments show that in 2018/19 pupil numbers were 2995. Anticipated outcomes for 2019/20 as stated in Improvement Plans and IMS Reports were to increase numbers through development of larger group teaching and digital technology. In March 2020 the first lock-down was announced. This had a significant impact on the music service. Digital technology was widely used, initially through Glow and Google Classrooms and Teams and in August the service was able to deliver tuition using Video Conferencing. The lack of face to face teaching resulted in a significant drop in pupil numbers. Whilst the technology was vital at the time, not all pupils were suited to it. When face to face lessons were re-introduced numbers increased, the IMS is currently delivering to 1972 pupils. We have a current waiting list of 1378 pupils	If the IMS has reduced capacity pupils on the waiting list will remain. In April 2021, the Scottish Government manifesto pledged that all instrumental tuition will be free of charge. This will be difficult to fulfill with less capacity. Digital delivery has been developed very successfully and will remain as an integral tool for instructors, but presents almost as many challenges as it does solutions. For example, group lessons of any size are not feasible for meaningful progression, especially at the early stages of musical development. School resources both in terms of hardware and staff are in short supply and accommodation is often not suitable. The majority of pupils prefer face to face delivery * see external consultation.
External Consultation	Music Centre Review, Engage Aberdeenshire	In November 2021 a survey was sent out to all parents and carers of pupils receiving instrumental tuition in schools. Engaged participants amounted to 357. 67.6% of respondents said they would make use of the Music Centre in the future; 66.1% of respondents said they would prefer face to face sessions with no online delivery with 21.7% stating that they prefer an option with 25% online delivery	Digital delivery is a valuable tool, however, face to face delivery is preferred.

Type	Source	It says?	It Means?
Other Evidence	Scottish Government Free Tuition Announcement	In April 2021 the Scottish Government announced that instrumental tuition in Scotland will be free.	Until March 2020, Aberdeenshire charged a fee for instrumental tuition. The fees were suspended in March 2020 due to the pandemic and equability of delivery. The announcement of free tuition has taken away the opportunity to raise significant revenue for the IMS. In 2019/20 a revenue of £427,371 was achieved. This has put increased pressure on the Service
Internal Consultation	IMS Working Groups	2 IMS Working Groups were formed by inviting instructors to participate in order to allow their views to be part of the process of IMS development. Group 1 were consulted on Music Centre matters and Group 2 were involved with the IMS delivery of tuition. Regular discussion take place via Teams between the instructors in the groups and the Head of Service, Communities, Wellbeing and Partnerships and the IMS Manager. The Head of Service leads discussions related to the redesign of both the IMS as a whole and Music Centre. The 2 groups now meet as one	Staff are consulted on matters that affect them and the service as a whole
Internal Consultation	IMS Staff Survey. How Good is our Instrumental Music Service	All IMS staff were invited to take part in the survey. Pertinent questions relating to the current delivery including management formed the contents of the document	Staff views are important, especially during a time of change
Internal Consultation	Trade Union involvement	Trade Union Representatives were included in all discussion groups and consultations	Union Members are kept informed of any changes and developments

4.6. Accounting for the Views of Children and Young People

Music Centre Review Survey

Regular updates to all service users with termly letters to parents and carers

4.7. Promoting the Wellbeing of Children and Young People

Continued current levels of instrumental tuition promote personal and academic achievement. Instrumental music activities both as an isolated activity and group activities promote a sense of wellbeing among young people whilst developing healthy social behaviors including self esteem and respect for one another

4.8. Upholding Children and Young People's Rights

The Survey as well as regular contact with children including during the lock-downs using digital technology allow for the views of children to be respected. The MS website gives children access to information

4.9. Overall Outcome

All Negative Impacts Can Be Mitigated.

The current budget does not match the current FTE. If significant saving are required there will be a reduction on IMS resources including staffing. Mitigation through the implementation of the assessment's Action Plan will aim to maintain current service delivery with a view to future development and expansion of activities

5. Equalities and Fairer Scotland Duty Impact Assessment

5.1. Protected Groups

Indicator	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Unknown
Age (Younger)	Yes			
Age (Older)			Yes	
Disability		Yes		
Race		Yes		
Religion or Belief		Yes		
Sex		Yes		
Pregnancy and Maternity		Yes		
Sexual Orientation		Yes		
Gender Reassignment		Yes		
Marriage or Civil Partnership		Yes		

5.2. Socio-economic Groups

Indicator	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Unknown
Low income		Yes		
Low wealth		Yes		
Material deprivation			Yes	
Area deprivation			Yes	
Socioeconomic background	Yes			

5.3. Positive Impacts

Impact Area	Impact
Age (Younger)	IMS redesign to expand whole class group tuition may give more opportunity to children who might not otherwise been able to participate due to reduction of one to one instrumental lessons
Age (Younger)	Whole class tuition giving more opportunities to experience instrumental music activities
Socioeconomic background	Large group and whole class delivery may enable to IMS to encourage pupils from these groups to engage and participate in instrumental music where they may not have done in a one to one or small group setting

5.4. Negative Impacts and Mitigations

Impact Area	Details and Mitigation
-------------	------------------------

Impact Area	Details and Mitigation
Age (Older)	<p>Fewer pupils being able to continue onto SQA attainment</p> <p>Can be mitigated Yes</p> <p>Mitigation Manage delivery through the IMS redesign in order to facilitate tuition for those dedicated to develop skills and attainment in instrumental music</p> <p>Timescale Immediate</p>
Area deprivation	<p>A reduced IMS will mean that there are fewer opportunities for children who live in areas of deprivation. Fewer instructors to deliver tuition and transport issues for Music Centre activities for those who live in rural areas. Public transport such as buses may not have timetables that align to the programming</p> <p>Can be mitigated Yes</p> <p>Mitigation Digital tuition has the potential to be delivered from any location</p> <p>Timescale Immediate</p>
Area deprivation	<p>A reduced IMS will mean that there are fewer opportunities for children who live in areas of deprivation. Fewer instructors to deliver tuition and transport issues for Music Centre activities for those who live in rural areas. Public transport such as buses may not have timetables that align to the programming</p> <p>Can be mitigated Yes</p> <p>Mitigation Digital technology can assist in this area but generates challenges that need addressing. Free public transport from February 2022 may be helpful for those areas where suitable public transport is available</p> <p>Timescale Immediate</p>
Material deprivation	<p>Inability to purchase own instrument</p> <p>Can be mitigated Yes</p> <p>Mitigation Encouraging families that can afford to purchase their own instruments leave IMS stock availability for free loan</p> <p>Timescale Immediate</p>

5.5. Evidence

Type	Source	It says?	It Means?
------	--------	----------	-----------

Type	Source	It says?	It Means?
Internal Data	Customer complaints	Complaints regarding the replacement and repair of instruments in the care of a household. Common complaints are that families on low income cannot afford to repair or replacement of damaged instruments	IMS may be unable to provide suitable/serviceable instruments
Other Evidence	IMS Website and Instrumental Music Tuition Portal	The IMS website and IMS tuition portal is available to the public including protected groups	IMS information is accessible

5.6. Engagement with affected groups

Appropriate and relevant information regarding the Service is accessible to all groups that are likely to be affected

5.7. Ensuring engagement with protected groups

Up to date EIAs. Accessible information and continued contact

5.8. Evidence of engagement

Customer and staff surveys. The IMS Portal includes the opportunity for protected groups to engage with the IMS with pertinent information on line. This information is stored on the database within GDPR policy and confidentiality guidelines

5.9. Overall Outcome

All Negative Impacts Can Be Mitigated.

Mitigations include whole class and large group tuition as well as digital delivery to engage with young people who may not have been able to participate otherwise. Encourage families to purchase their own instruments in order to leave IMS stock available to those that are unable manage the financial outlay

5.10. Improving Relations

Improved communication. Direct service users, potential service users and partners to appropriate and relevant information more regulatory. E.g Aberdeenshire Council-IMS website and IMS Tuition Portal

5.11. Opportunities of Equality

If savings are not required and the IMS is able to maintain the current FTE, the continued development and utilisation of blended learning and delivery using digital technology will advance equality of opportunity for those that would not otherwise been able to access instrumental tuition

6. Health Inequalities Impact Assessment

6.1. Health Behaviours

Indicator	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Unknown
Healthy eating		Yes		
Exercise and physical activity		Yes		
Substance use – tobacco		Yes		
Substance use – alcohol		Yes		
Substance use – drugs		Yes		
Mental health			Yes	

6.2. Negative Impacts and Mitigations

Impact Area	Details and Mitigation
Mental health	<p>Music tuition and associated activities have a positive effect on Mental Health. An IMS with limited capacity will have a negative impact on children that as a consequence receive less tuition or for children that are unable to access tuition at all</p> <p>Can be mitigated Yes</p> <p>Mitigation The IMS will aim to balance tuition in the event of a reduced service by offering whole class activities in Primary schools developing group tuition and digital delivery in the Academies. Access to funding for instrumental resources will be addressed for efficient and equitable utilisation of instruments and equipment</p> <p>Timescale Immediate</p>

6.3. Evidence

Type	Source	It says?	It Means?
Internal Data	Customer correspondence	Letters from parents regarding child's current state of mental health. Digital learning can be detrimental to some children's health and wellbeing and beneficial to others	Instrumental music tuition can be beneficial the the health and well being of children. The capacity for a variety of delivery methods is integral to an effective service
Internal Data	Instructor updates	Instructor updates and reports on the effect of various aspects and delivery of music tuition.	Instructors need the capacity to deliver in a variety of ways to ensure GIRFEC is being observed

6.4. Overall Outcome

All Negative Impacts Can Be Mitigated.

Access to funding for resources to be addressed in order for equitable and efficient use of instrumental resources

7. Action Plan

Planned Action	Details	
Continued work on the redesign of the IMS pertaining to budgetary constraints	Lead Officer	Justin Brook
	Repeating Activity	No
	Planned Start	Monday April 05, 2021
	Planned Finish	Friday September 30, 2022
	Expected Outcome	A refreshed and updated service that is sustainable and able to work within set budgets
	Resource Implications	The budget set for the IMS needs to match the current FTE (36) in order to meet full potential
Instrumental tuition will be maintained	Lead Officer	Justin Brook
	Repeating Activity	Yes
	Frequency	Ongoing
	Duration	Ongoing
	Expected Outcome	If capacity is reduced through savings then fewer children may receive tuition and children currently registered for lessons may receive them less frequently
	Resource Implications	Inability to purchase or repair instruments because of budgetary limitations will potentially reduce capacity to deliver tuition
Build on utilisation of digital delivery and accompanying challenges identified since March 2020 due to the Coronavirus Pandemic. Staff development through CPLD and in partnership with Education Development and ICT departments	Lead Officer	Justin Brook
	Repeating Activity	No
	Planned Start	Monday March 01, 2021
	Planned Finish	Friday October 28, 2022
	Expected Outcome	More efficient use of IMS resources
	Resource Implications	School will require suitable digital hardware and accommodation. Particularly primary schools

Planned Action	Details	
Expand large group teaching to a greater number of instructors	Lead Officer	Justin Brook
	Repeating Activity	Yes
	Frequency	Ongoing
	Duration	Ongoing
	Expected Outcome	Fulfill Scottish Government Free Tuition pledge. Aim to manage increased demand
	Resource Implications	Instrument supply. Families will be encouraged to purchase and maintain their own instruments for those that are financially able, allowing for availability of IMS instrument stock for those that are not.
Develop class tuition opportunities with less conventional IMS instruments. This model has already been initiated with planned cascading of experiences and skills throughout the IMS	Lead Officer	Justin Brook
	Repeating Activity	Yes
	Frequency	Ongoing
	Duration	Ongoing
	Expected Outcome	Manage free tuition opportunities in a whole class environment using instruments such as Chalumeau, Plastic Brass, P Buzz and Ukulele
	Resource Implications	Identify funding opportunities other than IMS core funding